

## **AGENDA ITEM**

### **50-2(2) DECEMBER 2017**

**DATE:** November 22, 2017

**TO:** Members, Board of Trustees

**FROM:** Randall Difuntorum, Program Manager, Professional Competence

**SUBJECT:** Ten-Hour New Attorney Training Program – Contract Approval for Learning Management System

---

#### **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

At its October 6, 2017 meeting, the Board of Trustees (“Board”) approved the procurement of an e-learning vendor to develop the interactive education modules for the State Bar’s 10-Hour New Attorney Training Program. This agenda item seeks Board approval for consulting services to implement a Learning Management System (LMS) which is required to host the new program.

---

#### **BACKGROUND**

The “New Attorney Training Program,” under Rule 2.53(D) of Title 2, Division 4, Chapter 1 of the Rules of the State Bar, becomes operative on February 1, 2018, and provides that: “A new member is required to complete a State Bar New Attorney Training program during the first year of admission which can also be applied to the regular MCLE requirement.” InfoPro Learning, an experienced e-learning vendor, has been procured and assigned to create the e-learning modules that will be SCORM 1.2 and WCAG 2.0 compliant. Although the State Bar previously has used InReach as the LMS for hosting online education, a new LMS solution is needed going forward because it is understood that InReach will continue to be the LMS operated by the former State Bar sections in its transition to a new separate entity.

#### **DISCUSSION**

IT has explored various options for an LMS solution and a summary of IT’s vendor assessment research is provided as Attachment A. The LMS must be integrated with existing State Bar systems in order for the e-learning content to be accessible through each new attorney’s membership profile. The modules will need to be accessed by approximately 9,000 admittees annually, with peak access by multiple simultaneous users anticipated after each primary swearing-in ceremony (June and November) and near the end of each MCLE compliance period (December – January). Compliance reports and data will need to be generated for the MCLE Compliance staff to monitor completion and prompt follow-up reminders to those who have not completed the requirement. Each year the curriculum will need to be made available to a new set of new admittees, and the access to the prior year’s group will need to be ended at some point following completion of the curriculum. Of the options presented, IT recommends

InfoPro LMS Gnosis Connect Option B (see page 13 of Attachment A) as its services will meet the requirements at a competitive cost.

Board Book Tab 4.3, Section 2, requires that any project for consulting services, capital equipment or technology purchases with anticipated expenditures exceeding \$75,000 must be specifically identified in the annual budget process and approved by the Board of Trustees. This agenda item requests that the Board approve an agreement with InfoPro LMS Gnosis Connect, not to exceed \$90,000, to implement a new LMS. This agreement will provide for LMS hosting of the e-learning modules for a two-year term.

After the two-year period, it is anticipated that the State Bar will consider a long-term permanent LMS solution for the new attorney program and for all other State Bar produced online education.

### **FISCAL/PERSONNEL IMPACT**

Funding for this consulting agreement is not in the 2018 preliminary budget adopted by the Board at its November meeting but is expected to be added to the final budget presented to the Board for adoption in January 2018.

### **RULE AMENDMENTS**

None

### **BOARD BOOK IMPACT**

None

### **BOARD GOALS & OBJECTIVES**

Goal: 2. Ensure a timely, fair, and appropriately resourced admissions, discipline, and regulatory system for the more than 250,000 lawyers licensed in California.

Objective: d. Develop and implement new attorney MCLE requirements and evaluate their impact and effectiveness.

### **RECOMMENDATION**

Staff recommends that the Board of Trustees approve the following resolution:

**RESOLVED**, that the Board of Trustees approves a contract with InfoPro LMS Gnosis Connect in the amount of \$90,000 for the Learning Management System described herein.

### **ATTACHMENT(S) LIST**

A. IT Summary of Options for a Learning Management Solution



**The State Bar of California**  
**Information Technology**  
***Learning Management System (LMS)***  
**Vendor Assessments**  
**Applications Team**  
**11/20/2017**  
**Murat Avsar**



## *Learning Management System (LMS)* Problem Statement

An IT solution is needed to implement the State Bar's 10-Hour new attorney MCLE program that is required by State Bar rule to be available to new attorneys starting on February 1, 2018. The new admittees are required to complete the 10-hours of e-learning education within the first year following admission, beginning in February 2018, and every admission date thereafter for each new class of attorneys. InfoPro Learning, an experienced e-learning vendor, has been procured and assigned to create 9 separate e-learning modules that are SCORM 1.2 and WCAG 2.0 compliant.

IT assistance is needed to provide a solution for the content to be accessed through each new attorney's membership profile. The modules will need to be accessed by approx. 9,000 admittees annually, with peak access by multiple simultaneous users anticipated after each primary swearing-in ceremony (June and November) and near the end of each MCLE compliance period (December – January).

Compliance reports and data will need to be generated for the MCLE Compliance staff to monitor completion and prompt follow-up reminders to those who have not completed the requirement. Each year the curriculum will need to be made available to a new set of new admittees, and the access to the prior year's group will need to be ended at some point following completion of the curriculum.

A Learning Management System (LMS) or another hosting alternative needs to be explored for the short term purpose of implementing the new program by the February 1, 2018 start date, prior to the Bar's more comprehensive consideration and selection of a long term solution/vendor for all future educational content to be produced by the State Bar.



## *Learning Management System (LMS)* Solution Approach and Vendor Evaluations

IT team researched the possible solutions and found out 3 vendors solutions plus the company has contract with us for content preparation (InfoPro). They are selected based on rating provided some third party websites such as [www.elearningindustry.com](http://www.elearningindustry.com), [www.capterra.com](http://www.capterra.com), [www.pcmag.com](http://www.pcmag.com), etc.

1. Accord LMS (<https://www.accordlms.com/>)
2. Absorb LMS (<https://www.absorblms.com/features/pricing/>)
3. Cornerstone LMS (<https://www.cornerstoneondemand.com/>)
4. InfoPro LMS

In addition to those vendors, IT also identified some open source LMS providers, which can be found in the URL (<https://elearningindustry.com/directory/software-categories/learning-management-systems/license/open>). Some are free and on-prem hosted solutions. They have more risk such as support model, disappearing from the market in long run. However they can be short term solution.



## *Learning Management System (LMS)*

### Solution Approach and Vendor Evaluations

○ Vendor Evaluation Questionnaires and responses summary

Req ID	Requirements	Accord LMS	Absorb LMS	Cornerstone LMS	InfoPro
1	It should be compatible SCORM 1.2 and WCAG 2.0	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
2	It will be implemented in 2-3 months	Yes (upto 8 weeks)	Average implementation with integrations is 8-12 weeks	Yes (8 - 12 Weeks)	Yes (8-10 week development process)
3	Cloud or On-Prem or both	Both options are available	Cloud Only	Cloud Only	Both (System can be deployed on the cloud or on premise. although Infopro's proposed solution is cloud based)
4	Cloud Providers	AWS for Video and Content in Cogeco-pier1, On-Prem	AWS	Azure for now and planning to move AWS	AWS
5	It requires supporting 12000+ people external members a year	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
6	It should have API or data collection specifications when started, stopped, resumed and completed. It will be downloaded into our system for further evaluations	Yes	We collected Start Date, Completion Date and total time spent (minutes) per course. We also log each lesson attempt Start Date/Time and Duration in minutes. You can have direct access to a offline copy of your database built for the Business Intelligence add-on module.	Yes	The system will support 12,000+ yearly users
7	It should have Active Directory and token-based authentication	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
8	Robust administration process	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
9	It should have video and audio training capabilities	Yes	MP4 and MP3 file formats can be added as learning objects	Yes	Yes
10	It should have survey capability to seek the people feedback	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes built at course level
11	Strong training capability for internal admin people	Yes	Admin trainnig is included	Yes	FAQ's, training videos, and onsite/on demand training
12	Estimated cost breakdown (for Active 12000 Members)	\$40,150	\$92,500	\$136,500	Option-1-\$43,000 Option-2-\$50,000
13	Custom fields (member id, name/last name, etc.) can be passed to LMS and report the progress accordingly	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes, data can be transmitted to and from the system



## *Learning Management System (LMS)* Solution Approach and Vendor Evaluations

### 1- Accord LMS – Features.

#### Included Core LMS Features

- ✓ Affordable Active Learner Pricing for Course Utilization
- ✓ Unlimited Registered Users with Free Resource Access
- ✓ Intuitive Learner Dashboard with Easy Content Access
- ✓ PC, iPad and Mobile compatible Learning
- ✓ Gamification and Social / Community Learning
- ✓ Blended Learning with Online, ILT and existing Assets
- ✓ Role and Profile Based Learning Enrollment
- ✓ Drag and Drop Learning Content Management
- ✓ Reporting Dashboard with Instant Charts
- ✓ Reporting with On Page Grouping, Filtering and Sorting
- ✓ Automated and Scheduled Report Delivery
- 🔗 Learn more about [Accord LMS Features](#)

#### Included Enterprise LMS Features

- ✓ Built In Quiz and Survey Builder
- ✓ Secure Installation and Database for each Customer
- ✓ HTTPS and Daily Security Scans
- ✓ Unlimited Custom Branded Portals
- ✓ Unlimited LMS Admin Types and Permissions
- ✓ Extended Enterprise for Partners, Franchisees, etc.
- ✓ Web Farm Ready, Extraordinary Scalability
- ✓ Web Content Management System (CMS)
- ✓ eCommerce for Courseware and Shippable Products
- 🔗 Learn More about [Enterprise LMS Features](#)

#### World Class Integrations

- ✓ Seamless Access to over 20,000 Courses
- ✓ Auto-Login / Single-Sign-On
- ✓ Active Directory, Live ID, and other Authentications
- ✓ GoToMeeting, GoToWebinar and GoToTraining
- ✓ Sharepoint Connector (beta)
- ✓ Amazon S3 Storage with CloudFront CDN
- ✓ Box, DropBox, OneDrive, Google Drive
- ✓ .Net API and RESTful Web API for Data Integration
- ✓ Support for Hundreds of Third Party Plug-Ins
- 🔗 Learn More about [LMS Integration](#)



## *Learning Management System (LMS)*

### Solution Approach and Vendor Evaluations

#### 1- Accord LMS – Pricing

- Hosted on our servers, SaaS Model. We provide the hosting providing you access to your Accord LMS platform for up to a specified number of active learners. An active learner is someone who actually takes a course you want to track their progress on.
- No charge for inactive learners and you can have as many as you want.
- Relevant tiers of learners and the associated pricing in the table below.

Designated Number of Active Learners	Annual Fee
Annual License Fee for up to 5,000 active learners	\$22,200
Annual License Fee for up to 7,500 active learners	\$28,200
Annual License Fee for up to 10,000 active learners	\$31,800
Annual License Fee for up to 12,500 active learners	\$35,400
Annual License Fee for up to 15,000 active learners	\$39,000

- There are one-time fees associated with setting up the Accord LMS and integrating Accord into other key applications such as Active Directory, Single Sign ON, Payroll, HR and many others. We encourage the integration of Accord into these other key applications as the productivity gains associated with doing so can be remarkable.

Accord LMS One-time Implementation Fees	Pricing
Setup Fee: Included in the Setup Fee is learner interface branding, initial configuration, support and training.	\$2,000
Active Directory (AD) Integration	\$1,500
Single Sign On (SSO)	\$1,250

**Total Cost: \$40,150**





## *Learning Management System (LMS)* Solution Approach and Vendor Evaluations

### **2- Absorb LMS – Features.**

Applicable to those clients who are reselling and/or distributing online training to external users. Pricing consists of two components; the Absorb LMS license fee and a one-time user license fee that allows users unlimited access to your Absorb LMS Portal.

#### **2017 A la Carte Pricing**

Absorb LMS License Fee		One-Time User Fee
\$1,250/month	\$13,500/year	\$5.00/user

Save 10% by pre-paying the Absorb License Fee.

Setup Fee Including Training and Support
\$4,000

Setup Includes:

- Portal Configuration and UI Branding
- Absorb Shopping Cart Integration with Select Payment Gateways Admin Training
- 100GB of Storage. Increments of 100GB Available@ \$75/Month



## *Learning Management System (LMS)* Solution Approach and Vendor Evaluations

### 2- Absorb LMS – Pricing

#### 2017 Optional Services Pricing

SSO API	\$3,500
RESTful API	\$4,000
Scheduled Data Feed	\$3,500
Standard Historical Data Import	\$1,750
Custom Historical Data Import	Starting at \$5,000
Additional Custom Skins	\$1,250
100 GB Incremental Storage	\$75/month
Custom Data Export	\$1,500

#### Estimated Cost Breakdown for 12000 Members

One-Time Fees	
Set-up (portal configuration, branding, training, project mgmt.)	\$4,000
SSO API	\$3,500
RESTful API	\$1,750
Recurring Fees	\$1,250
Annual A La Carte Licensing Fee	\$75/month
Business Intelligence Direct Database	\$1,500
Other Fees	
User Fees for 12,000 Member (\$5 charged one time per user)	

**Total Cost: \$92,500**



## *Learning Management System (LMS)* Solution Approach and Vendor Evaluations

### 3- Cornerstone LMS – Features

Use Cornerstone Learning to improve talent mobility and employee performance. Go beyond ensuring compliance to fostering a culture of self-guided, continuous learning by delivering inspiring, modern, and tailored training.

#### eLearning

Intuitive Course Publisher	Test Engine	Offline Player
Mobile Learning and Video Streaming	Content Management Developer Sea	Points, Badges, and Leaderboard for Top learners

#### Virtual Instructor Led Training

Event Administration	Resource Management	Virtual Classroom Integration
Custom Form Creation	Custom Template Creation	Facilities Management
Provider and Vendor Management	Automated Registration and Roster Management	



## *Learning Management System (LMS)*

### Solution Approach and Vendor Evaluations

### 3- Cornerstone LMS – Pricing

#### One-Time Services

<b>Implementations</b>	
Learning Implementation – Small	Included
<b>Technical Services</b>	
Singe Sign On – Standard (SSO)	Included
Inbound Data Feed – Learning (IDFL)	Included

#### Summary of Fees

Software & Other Recurring (1 Year)	114,000.00
One-Time Services	22,500.00
<b>Totals</b>	<b>\$136,500.00</b>

**Total Cost: \$136,500**



## *Learning Management System (LMS)* Solution Approach and Vendor Evaluations

### **4- InfoPro LMS (GnosisConnect) – Features**

- The GnosisConnect learning management system was built to be the most intuitive, light weight, and easy to manage LMS platform on the market. With it's simple yet powerful base features and open framework to allow for easy development, GnosisConnect is the perfect foundation for all LMS implementations.
- Modern user interface
- Lightweight and easy to deploy
- Streamlined administrative features
- In-depth reporting database
- Robust infrastructure to support high volume of users
- Accepts all file types
- Open framework for full customizability
- Integrate with any third party tools or applications



## *Learning Management System (LMS)*

### Solution Approach and Vendor Evaluations

#### 4- InfoPro LMS – Pricing

##### Option A:

- Infopro Learning can implement their standard edition of GnosisConnect LMS product in 4-6 weeks. This platform is lightweight, intuitive, and powerful enough to handle all the basic delivery and tracking of State Bar of California's learning.

Pros	Cons
Low implementation cost	Unable to integrate with existing systems
Prebuild for quick implementation	Only able to change predefined fields
Offers required delivery and reporting features	User management will be done manually

Serial#	Tasks	Description	Cost
1	System Subscription	Up to 12,000 users	\$36,000 (annual)
2	Standard Implementation	Implementation includes: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• White labeling</li> <li>• Email notification setup</li> <li>• Domain mapping</li> <li>• System email mapping</li> </ul>	\$5,000 (single payment)
3	Onboarding (one-time)	One on-site training session and unlimited on-demand GoToMeeting training sessions for 30 days.	\$2,000 (single payment)

**Total Cost: \$43,000**



## *Learning Management System (LMS)*

### Solution Approach and Vendor Evaluations

#### 4- InfoPro LMS – Pricing

##### Option B:

- The custom learning management solution offers all the basic GnosisConnect functionality but also allows the Infopro team the ability to tailor the system to State Bar of California's specific needs.

Pros	Cons
Offers required delivery and reporting features	Higher implementation cost
Integrate with all existing systems	Longer implementation time
System structure can be completely customized	

Serial#	Tasks	Description	Cost
1	System Subscription	Up to 12,000 users	\$36,000 (annual)
2	Standard Implementation	Implementation includes: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>White labeling</li> <li>Email notification setup</li> <li>Domain mapping</li> <li>System email mapping</li> </ul>	\$5,000 (single payment)
3	Integration with existing systems	Integration for automated user management	\$3,000-7,000 (single payment)
4	Single Sign On (SSO)	SSO with website	\$3,000 (single payment)
5	User State Bar ID as the primary record key	Changing the system from email account based to State Bar Numbers based	\$1,500 (single payment)
6	Onboarding (one-time)	One on-site training session and unlimited on-demand GoToMeeting training sessions for 30 days.	\$2,000 (single payment)

**Total Cost: \$50,500**



## *Learning Management System (LMS)* Cost Comparison

### **All Vendors cost comparison**

<b>Cost</b>	<b>Accord LMS</b>	<b>Absorb LMS</b>	<b>Cornerstone LMS</b>	<b>InfoPro - Option 1</b>	<b>InfoPro - Option 2</b>
Base Cost	\$35,400.00	\$13,500.00			
User Fee	-	\$60,000.00	\$114,000.00	\$36,000.00	\$36,000.00
Implementation/Setup/Training	\$2,000.00	\$4,000.00	\$22,500.00	\$7,000.00	\$7,000.00
Adds On (SSO, AD, Data Retrieval, etc)	\$2,750.00	\$15,000.00			\$7,500.00
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$40,150.00</b>	<b>\$92,500.00</b>	<b>\$136,500.00</b>	<b>\$43,000.00</b>	<b>\$50,500.00</b>