

**DRAFT**  
**PUBLIC MINUTES**

THE COMMITTEE OF BAR EXAMINERS

OF

THE STATE BAR OF CALIFORNIA

February 2 and 3, 2018

State Bar of California Offices  
845 S. Figueroa Street  
Los Angeles, California

A meeting of the Committee of Bar Examiners of The State Bar of California convened in open session at 10:00 a.m., Friday, February 2, 2018, in a meeting room at the State Bar offices in Los Angeles, Erika Hiramatsu, Chair, presiding. Officers and members present were: Erika Hiramatsu, Chair, David A. Torres, Vice-Chair, Angeli O. Agatep, M.D., James A. Bolton, Ph.D., Robert S. Brody, Alex H. Chan, James H. Efting, Dolores Heisinger, Karen M. Goodman, Larry Kaplan, Paul A. Kramer, Alexander C. Lawrence, Jr., Esther P. Lin, Bethany J. Peak, Patricia M. Villalobos and Lee H. Wallach, Members. State Bar staff members in attendance were: Amy C. Nuñez, Interim Director III, Admissions; George C. Leal, Program Manager II, Educational Standards; Lisa Jeong Cummins, Program Manager III, Examinations; Greg S. Shin, Program Manager III, Operations and Management; Mark Torres-Gil, Program Manager III, Moral Character Determinations; Natalie Leonard, Program Manager III; Christina Doell, Program Manager I; Kim Wong, Administrative Supervisor; Destie Overpeck, Assistant General Counsel; Leah Wilson, Chief Executive Officer; Joanna Mendoza, Board of Trustee Member; Ron Pi, Principal Analyst; and Alex Yufik, Case Manager, Lawyer Assistant Program. Also in attendance were: Former Executive Director Elizabeth Parker, Elise Walton, Roger Bolus, Ph.D., Dean Dean Barbieri, Dean Ira Spiro, Dean Mitch Winick, Dean Greg Brandes, Dean Laura Palazzolo, Dean Andrea Lua, Dean Maren Carmona, and Dean Chet Zaluga. The open session portion of the meeting concluded at 2:40 p.m., at which time the Committee's subcommittees convened its meetings. The Committee meeting reconvened into open session at 9:10 a.m. on Saturday, February 3, 2017. All Committee members, excluding Angeli Agatep and staff who were in attendance on Friday were present on Saturday, except Leah Wilson. The meeting went into closed at 10:30 a.m. and the meeting adjourned at 11:35 a.m.

**PRESENTATION ON MORAL CHARACTER APPLICANTS AND**  
**THE LAWYERS ASSISTANCE PROGRAM**

It was by common consent agreed that the Committee's appreciation be extended to Alex Yufik, Case Manager, for his presentation on the Moral Character applicants and the Lawyers Assistant Program.

### APPENDIX I REVIEW

It was by common consent agreed that material from the Appendix I review from Elizabeth Parker and Elise Walton be received and filed.

### BASIC PSYCHOMETRIC PRINCIPLES AND JOB ANALYSIS STUDY

It was by common consent agreed that the Committee's appreciation be extended to Roger Bolus, Ph.D. and Ron Pi for their presentations on the Basic Psychometric Principles and Job Analysis Study.

### RECOGNITION OF RESIGNED MEMBER

It was moved, seconded and duly carried that the Committee's gratitude be extended to an outgoing Committee member Larry Sheingold for his service on the Committee and that the following citation be prepared and presented to him:

This citation is presented to Larry Sheingold by the Committee of Bar Examiners of the State Bar of California in recognition of his service as a Committee Member during the 2008-2017 Committee years and his distinguished service to the legal profession in California.

### DECEMBER 1 AND 2, 2017 COMMITTEE MEETING PUBLIC MINUTES

It was moved, seconded and duly carried that the minutes taken during the public session of the meetings on December 1 and 2, 2017, be approved.

### 2017 ANNUAL REPORT

It was moved, seconded and duly carried that the Committee of Bar Examiners of The State Bar of California 2017 Annual Report, as attached to these minutes as "Item 1" be received and filed.

### NOVEMBER AND DECEMBER 2017 KEY INDICATORS

It was by common consent agreed that the November and December 2017 Key Indicators for the Office of Admissions/Committee of Bar Examiners be received and filed.

### SCHEDULE FOR MARCH 23, 2018 COMMITTEE MEETING

It was by common consent agreed that the schedule for the March 23, 2018 Meeting, which will be held at the State Bar of California Offices in San Francisco, California, be received and filed.

**SUBCOMMITTEE ON EXAMINATIONS**

**2017 – 2018 SUBCOMMITTEE GOALS**

It was by common consent agreed that the 2017 – 2018 goals for the Subcommittee on Examinations be approved.

**SUBCOMMITTEE ON OPERATIONS AND MANAGEMENT**

**FINANCIAL ANALYSIS REPORT AS OF NOVEMBER 30, 2017**

It was by common consent agreed that the Financial Analysis report as of November 30, 2017 for the Admissions Fund be received and filed.

**2017 – 2018 SUBCOMMITTEE GOALS**

It was by common consent agreed that the 2017 – 2018 goals for the Subcommittee on Operations and Management be approved.

**SUBCOMMITTEE ON EDUCATIONAL STANDARDS**

**NOTICE OF CHANGES IN LAW SCHOOL ADMINISTRATORS**

It was by common consent agreed that the notice from Abraham Lincoln of the appointment of Scott A. McMillan as Registrar, effective December 11, 2017, be received and filed.

**2017 – 2018 SUBCOMMITTEE GOALS**

It was by common consent agreed that the 2017 – 2018 goals for the Subcommittee on Educational Standards be approved.

**SUBCOMMITTEE ON MORAL CHARACTER**

**2017 – 2018 SUBCOMMITTEE GOALS**

It was by common consent agreed that the 2017 – 2018 goals for the Subcommittee on Moral Character be approved.

**ADJOURNMENT**

Having concluded all the business scheduled for consideration during the open and closed sessions of the meeting, the meeting was adjourned at 11:35 a.m., Saturday, February 3, 2018.

**DRAFT**  
**PUBLIC MINUTES**

THE COMMITTEE OF BAR EXAMINERS  
OF  
THE STATE BAR OF CALIFORNIA

CONFERENCE CALL

February 20, 2018

State Bar of California Offices  
180 Howard Street  
San Francisco, California

845 S. Figueroa Street  
Los Angeles, California

A meeting of the Committee of Bar Examiners of The State Bar of California convened in open session at 3:00 p.m., Tuesday, February 20, 2018, via conference call in meeting rooms at the State Bar offices in San Francisco and Los Angeles, Erika Hiramatsu, Chair, presiding. Officers and members present were: Erika Hiramatsu, Chair, David A. Torres, Vice-Chair, Angeli O. Agatep, M.D., James A. Bolton, Ph.D., Alex H. Chan, James H. Efting, Kareem Gongora, Karen M. Goodman, Larry Kaplan, Paul A. Kramer, Alexander C. Lawrence, Jr., Esther P. Lin, Bethany J. Peak and Patricia M. Villalobos, Members. Robert S. Brody and Dolores Heisinger were absent. State Bar staff members in attendance were: Amy C. Nuñez, Interim Director III, Admissions; George C. Leal, Program Manager II, Educational Standards; Lisa Jeong Cummins, Program Manager III, Examinations; Greg S. Shin, Program Manager III, Operations and Management; Mark Torres-Gil, Program Manager III, Moral Character Determinations; Kim Wong, Administrative Supervisor; Destie Overpeck, Assistant General Counsel; and Donna Hershkowitz, Chief Programs Officer. Also in attendance was: Dean Laura Palazzolo. Other participants were: Dean Stanislaus Pulle and Dean Mitchel Winick. The open session portion of the meeting concluded at approximately 4:15 p.m. The meeting went into closed session at 4:20 p.m. and the meeting adjourned at 4:35 p.m.

**SUBCOMMITTEE ON EXAMINATIONS**

**PROPOSED GUIDELINES FOR ALLOCATION OF APPLICANTS,**  
**PRODUCTION OF EXAMINATION STATISTICS AND LAW SCHOOL LISTS**

It was moved, seconded and duly carried that the draft Guidelines for Allocation of Applicants, Production of Examination Statistics and Law School Lists, including how to define “takers” be approved.

**SUBCOMMITTEE ON OPERATIONS AND MANAGEMENT****COMMITTEE STRUCTURE UNDER BAGLEY-KEENE**

It was moved, seconded and duly carried that the Committee assign review of Chapter 6 testing violations to the Examinations Subcommittee and delegate the authority to make decisions on testing accommodation appeals, examination petitions, and time-sensitive exam eligibility requests to the Examinations Subcommittee for the periods during months when no Committee meeting are scheduled and/or during the four weeks before the California Bar Examination or First-Year Law Students' Examination, to ensure that applicants receive prompt decisions.

**OCTOBER 2017 FIRST-YEAR LAW STUDENTS' EXAMINATION  
COST ANALYSIS**

It was by common consent agreed that the report on costs for administering the October 2017 First-Year Law Students' Examination be received and filed.

**SUBCOMMITTEE ON EDUCATIONAL STANDARDS****SUMMARIES OF THE 2017 ANNUAL COMPLIANCE REPORTS  
SUBMITTED BY CALIFORNIA ACCREDITED LAW SCHOOLS**

It was by common consent agreed that the summaries of the 2017 Annual Compliance Reports filed by each California-accredited law school be received and filed.

**MCMILLAN ACADEMY OF LAW – RESPONSE TO  
NOTICE OF NONCOMPLIANCE**

It was moved, seconded and duly carried that the response of the McMillan Academy of Law to the Notice of Noncompliance issued on December 2, 2017 be received and filed; that a further inspection of the law school be conducted within the next 90 days to determine whether, under Rule 4.262(A), its response should be deemed satisfactory or whether, based upon that inspection and subsequent report and as provided by Rule 4.263, the Committee is able to determine that the law school is not or is not likely to be in compliance with these rules so that it may then notify the law school that it recommends probation or withdrawal of its registration.

**REPORT OF INTERIM INSPECTION OF AMERICAN INSTITUTE OF LAW**

It was moved, seconded and duly carried that the Interim Inspection Report of the American Institute of Law, the inspection having been conducted on December 5-6, 2017 by Educational Standards Consultant Sally Perring, be received and filed; that each of the recommended, suggested actions contained in the Report be adopted; that the law school's registration be continued and that its initial periodic inspection take place during the summer of 2021, unless an earlier inspection is found necessary by the

Committee.

JOHN F. KENNEDY UNIVERSITY COLLEGE OF LAW – MAJOR CHANGE  
REQUEST RE OPENING BRANCH CAMPUS IN SAN JOSE

It was moved, seconded and duly carried, with comments from Dean Pulle re: the Committee as agents of the Supreme Court, the process of the approval of the Hybrid J.D. Program, and economic statistics; and comments from Dean Winick re: branch campuses guidelines, that at this time consideration of the John F. Kennedy University College of Law request regarding opening branch campus in San Jose be deferred for further consideration during its next meeting pending additional information provided by staff.

SAN JOAQUIN COLLEGE OF LAW – PETITION FOR WAIVER  
OF NON-CLASSROOM UNIT LIMITATIONS

It was moved, seconded and duly carried that the petition submitted by San Joaquin College of Law (SJCOL) for a waiver of the unit restriction found in Guideline 6.6(D) (Externship, Clinical, Law Review and Similar Programs) of the Guidelines for Accredited Law School Rules, which would allow the school to offer academic credit of up to a maximum of 14 units of practical legal experience through externships and participation in the law school's law clinic, be received and filed; and that the request be granted for one year.

ADJOURNMENT

Having concluded all the business scheduled for consideration during the open and closed sessions of the meeting, the meeting was adjourned at 4:35 p.m., Friday, February 20, 2018.