



# The State Bar *of California*

---

## **OPEN AGENDA**

### **AGENDA ITEM O-100**

**APRIL 2022**

### **COMMITTEE OF BAR EXAMINERS**

#### OPEN SESSION MINUTES

#### THE COMMITTEE OF BAR EXAMINERS OF THE STATE BAR OF CALIFORNIA

March 18, 2022

Zoom Meeting  
State Bar of California Offices

A zoom meeting of the Committee of Bar Examiners of The State Bar of California convened in open session at 9:04 a.m., Friday, March 18, 2022, Chair Alexander C. Lawrence, Jr. presiding. Officers and members present were: Chair Alexander C. Lawrence, Jr., Vice-Chair Paul A. Kramer, James A. Bolton, Ph.D., Michael Cao, M.D., Alex H. Chan, James H. Efting, Kareem Gongora, Dolores Heisinger, Judge James E. Herman, Michael A. Iseri, Larry Kaplan, Bethany J. Peak, Members. Member Esther P. Lin joined the meeting at 9:25 a.m. Member Alex Chan left the meeting at 11:55 a.m. Members Robert S. Brody, Vincent Reyes, Judge Shelly Torrealba, David A. Torres, and Don Ajené Wilcoxson were absent. State Bar staff members in attendance were: Leah Wilson, Executive Director; Donna Hershkowitz, Chief of Programs; Amy C. Nuñez, Director III, Admissions; Audrey Ching, Assistant Director, Admissions; Tammy Campbell, Program Manager II, Operations and Management; Tara Clark, Program Manager II, Moral Character; Christina Doell, Program Manager II, Examination Grading; Lisa Cummins, Principal Program Analyst, Examination Development; Natalie Leonard, Principal Program Analyst, Educational Standards; Kim Wong, Administrative Supervisor, Admissions; David Lane, Senior Attorney, Moral Character; Jean Krasilnikoff, Attorney III, General Counsel; Devan McFarland, Sr. Administrative Assistant, Admissions; and Sonia Delen, Board of Trustees liaison. The open session portion was concluded at approximately 11:55 a.m. The meeting went into closed session at approximately 12:07 p.m. The closed session concluded at 1:02 p.m. The meeting went back into open session at approximately 1:03 p.m. The meeting adjourned at 1:03 p.m.

## PUBLIC COMMENTS

The Committee of Bar Examiners received 2 written public comments, 1 public comment pertaining to the February 2022 California Bar Exam.

### JANUARY 28, 2022 COMMITTEE OF BAR EXAMINERS PUBLIC MEETING MINUTES

It was moved, seconded and duly carried that the minutes taken during the public session of the meeting on January 28, 2022, be approved.

Moved by Heisinger, seconded by Cao.

The motion passed. Roll call vote:

Bolton – yes

Cao – yes

Chan – yes

Efting – yes

Gongora – yes

Heisinger – yes

Judge Herman - yes

Iseri – yes

Kaplan – yes

Kramer – yes

Peak – yes

### SCHEDULE FOR APRIL 22 – 23, 2022 COMMITTEE MEETING

It was by common consent agreed that the schedule for the April 22 – 23, 2022 Meeting, which will be held via a Zoom webinar, be received and filed.

## EXAMINATIONS

### REPORT ON 2021 – 2022 EXAMINATIONS GOALS

It was moved, seconded and duly carried that the report on 2021 – 2022 Examinations goals be approved.

Moved by Gongora, seconded by Peak.

The motion passed. Roll call vote:

Lawrence – yes

Bolton – yes

Cao – yes

Chan – yes

Efting – yes

Gongora – yes

Heisinger – yes  
Judge Herman - yes  
Iseri – yes  
Kramer – yes  
Lin – yes  
Peak – yes

## **OPERATIONS AND MANAGEMENT**

### **REPORT ON 2021 – 2022 OPERATIONS AND MANAGEMENT GOALS**

It was moved, seconded and duly carried that the report on 2021 – 2022 Operations and Management goals be approved.

Moved by Gongora, seconded by Iseri.

The motion passed. Roll call vote:

Lawrence – yes  
Bolton – yes  
Cao – yes  
Chan – yes  
Efting – yes  
Gongora – yes  
Heisinger – yes  
Judge Herman - yes  
Iseri – yes  
Kramer – yes  
Peak – yes

## **EDUCATIONAL STANDARDS**

### **INSPECTION OF CALIFORNIA SCHOOL OF LAW**

It was moved, seconded and duly carried that the Committee of Bar Examiners receives and files the inspection report of California School of Law conducted August 4-5, 2021, and adopts its recommendations; and it is

FURTHER MOVED, that the law school file a detailed progress report with supporting evidence documenting completion and continued compliance as to all recommendations as part of its 2022 Periodic Compliance Report due by November 15, 2022.; and

FURTHER MOVED, that the law school's registration as an unaccredited distance law school be continued and the law school's next inspection be set for summer 2023.

Moved by Gongora, seconded by Cao.

The motion passed. Roll call vote:

Lawrence – yes

Bolton – yes  
Cao – yes  
Chan – yes  
Efting – yes  
Gongora – yes  
Heisinger – yes  
Judge Herman - yes  
Iseri – yes  
Kaplan – yes  
Kramer – yes  
Peak – yes

INSPECTION OF CALIFORNIA SOUTHERN UNIVERSITY LAW SCHOOL

It was moved, seconded and duly carried that Committee of Bar Examiners receives and files the 2021 Periodic Inspection Report of California Southern University School of Law and adopts its recommendations; and it is

FURTHER MOVED that the school is directed to document completion of these recommendations in its 2022 Periodic Compliance Report; and

FURTHER MOVED that the school's registration as an unaccredited law school in the correspondence category be renewed and its next inspection set for summer 2026, unless the Committee determines that an inspection is required sooner, or the law school terminates its registration prior to that date; and

FURTHER MOVED that the laws school affirmatively and promptly advise the State Bar of its planned end dates for the JD program and non-JD program as soon as they are finalized or advise within 30 days of a decision to begin admitting new students into its JD or non-JD program.

Moved by Gongora, seconded by Heisinger.

The motion passed. Roll call vote:

Lawrence – yes  
Bolton – yes  
Cao – yes  
Chan – yes  
Efting – yes  
Gongora – yes  
Heisinger – yes  
Judge Herman - yes  
Iseri – yes  
Kaplan – yes  
Kramer – yes  
Peak – yes

RESPONSE TO NOTICE OF NONCOMPLIANCE FOR  
SAN FRANCISCO INTERNATIONAL UNIVERSITY COLLEGE OF LAW

It was moved, seconded and duly carried that the Committee of Bar Examiners find that San Francisco International University College of Law has not responded to the Notice of Noncompliance issued by the Committee; and it is

FURTHER MOVED that the Committee direct staff to attempt to schedule a remote inspection of the law school to offer a final opportunity to the law school to address its status; and

FURTHER MOVE, that at its next regularly scheduled meeting, the Committee will take notice that an inspection has been scheduled, or, if the law school has not responded to schedule an inspection by that time, that the Committee will consider whether to take final action to impose termination of registration.

Moved by Cao, seconded by Iseri.

The motion passed. Roll call vote:

Lawrence – yes

Bolton – yes

Cao – yes

Chan – yes

Efting – yes

Gongora – yes

Heisinger – yes

Judge Herman - yes

Iseri – yes

Kaplan – yes

Kramer – yes

Peak – yes

RESPONSE TO WARNING LETTER FROM  
AMERICAN HERITAGE UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW

It was moved, seconded and duly carried that the Committee of Bar Examiners receives and files the response of American Heritage University School of Law to the warning letter issued to the law school by the Committee at its December 3, 2021 meeting; and it is

FURTHER MOVED, that the Committee find that the response is not satisfactory to establish compliance and therefore issues a Notice of Noncompliance to the law school, and the law school is directed to respond within 15 days; and

FURTHER MOVED, that the Committee deny law school's request to waive unaccredited guideline 6.3 and forego teaching of legal research using hard copy materials; and

FURTHER MOVED, that the law school is provided with further notice pursuant to Rule 4.263 that the Committee believes that the inspection report and subsequent response demonstrates that the law school is likely to be out of compliance with the Unaccredited Law School Rules and, therefore, the Committee recommends and intends to pursue probation or termination of registration unless the law school can provide evidence to demonstrate compliance as part of its timely response to the Committee's Notice of Noncompliance.

Moved by Gongora, seconded by Bolton.

The motion passed. Roll call vote:

Lawrence – yes

Bolton – yes

Cao – yes

Chan – yes

Efting – yes

Gongora – yes

Heisinger – yes

Judge Herman - yes

Iseri – yes

Kaplan – yes

Kramer – yes

Peak – yes

REPORT ON PROGRESS REGARDING RECOMMENDATIONS FROM  
THE INSPECTION REPORT OF TAFT UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW

It was moved, seconded and duly carried that the Committee of Bar Examiners receive and file Taft Law School's Progress Report as to the recommendations adopted by the Committee of Bar Examiners after the law school's last inspection; and it is

FURTHER MOVED, that Taft Law School is directed to file an additional progress report specifically detailing its steps taken as to mandatory recommendation 3 and suggested recommendation 3 to address retention and attrition at the law school as part of its 2022 Periodic Compliance Report due November 15, 2022.

Moved by Efting, seconded by Cao.

The motion passed. Roll call vote:

Lawrence – yes

Bolton – yes

Cao – yes

Chan – yes

Efting – yes

Gongora – yes

Heisinger – yes

Judge Herman - yes

Iseri – yes

Kramer – yes

Peak – yes

REPORT ON PROGRESS REGARDING RECOMMENDATIONS FROM  
THE INSPECTION REPORT OF SAN FRANCISCO LAW SCHOOL

It was moved, seconded and duly carried that the November 15, 2021, progress report of San Francisco Law School regarding achieving or sustaining compliance with the recommendations set forth in the law school's 2020 Periodic inspection received and filed, and the law school's next progress report be due as scheduled by May 15, 2022, with an inspection to be set in winter 2023, to allow the law school to first file its 2022 Minimum, Cumulative Five-Year Bar Exam Pass Rate, due July 1, 2022.

Moved by Efting, seconded by Gongora.

The motion passed. Roll call vote:

Lawrence – yes

Bolton – yes

Cao – yes

Chan – yes

Efting – yes

Gongora – yes

Heisinger – yes

Judge Herman - yes

Iseri – yes

Kaplan – yes

Kramer – yes

Lin – abstain

Peak – yes

REPORT ON PROGRESS REGARDING RECOMMENDATIONS FROM  
THE INSPECTION REPORT OF PEOPLES COLLEGE OF LAW

It was moved, seconded and duly carried that Committee receive and file the Peoples College of Law Updated December 2021 Progress Report on Compliance with Recommendations in its State Bar Inspection Report of 2020, as set forth in Attachment A; and it is

FURTHER MOVED, that the law school's request to extend its waiver of time to fulfill the library requirements to August 2022 be granted; and

FURTHER MOVED, that the law school be directed to file an updated progress report within 30 days. If the law school does not provide a timely response, the Committee may issue a Notice of Noncompliance to seek the information needed to carry out its regulatory duties and gather the necessary information. The law school will still be required to file a progress report with its 2022 Periodic Compliance Report and each compliance report until the law school is inspected again, as previously directed by the Committee.

Moved by Efting, seconded by Gongora.

The motion passed. Roll call vote:

Lawrence – yes

Bolton – yes

Cao – yes

Chan – yes

Efting – yes

Gongora – yes

Heisinger – yes

Judge Herman - yes

Iseri – yes

Kaplan – yes

Kramer – yes

Lin – yes

Peak – yes

#### REPORT ON 2021 – 2022 EDUCATIONAL STANDARDS GOALS

It was moved, seconded and duly carried that the report on 2021 – 2022 Educational Standards goals be approved.

Moved by Heisinger, seconded by Cao.

The motion passed. Roll call vote:

Lawrence – yes

Bolton – yes

Cao – yes

Chan – yes

Efting – yes

Gongora – yes

Heisinger – yes

Judge Herman - yes

Iseri – yes

Kramer – yes

Lin – yes

Peak – yes

#### MORAL CHARACTER

#### REPORT ON 2021 – 2022 MORAL CHARACTER GOALS

It was moved, seconded and duly carried that the report on 2021 – 2022 Moral Character goals and accomplishments be approved.

Moved by Kramer, seconded by Peak.

The motion passed. Roll call vote:



Lawrence – yes  
Bolton – yes  
Cao – yes  
Chan – yes  
Efiting – yes  
Gongora – yes  
Heisinger – yes  
Judge Herman - yes  
Iseri – yes  
Kaplan – yes  
Kramer – yes  
Lin – yes  
Peak – yes

#### ADJOURNMENT

Having concluded all the business scheduled for consideration during the open and closed sessions of the meeting, the meeting was adjourned at 1:03 p.m., Friday, March 18, 2022.