



# The State Bar of California

---

## Committee of Bar Examiners Teleconference

Open Session Minutes  
Friday, September 1, 2023  
3:32 p.m. – 5:23 p.m.

**Time Meeting Commenced:** The Committee of Bar Examiners meeting commenced in open session at 3:32 p.m.

**Time Meeting Adjourned:** 5:23 p.m.

**Chair:** Paul A. Kramer

**Committee Coordinator:** Devan McFarland

**Members Present:** James A. Bolton, Ph.D., Michael Cao, M.D, Alex H. Chan, James Efting, Kareem Gongora [joined late], Dolores Heisinger, Larry Kaplan, Paul A. Kramer, Esther P. Lin [joined late], Bethany J. Peak Ashley Silva-Guzman, David A. Torres

**Members Absent:** Robert S. Brody, Alexander C. Lawrence, Jr., Vincent Reyes

**State Bar Executive Staff Present:** Leah Wilson and Donna Hershkowitz

## OPEN SESSION

### Call to Order

The Committee of Bar Examiners was called to order by Chair Kramer.

### I. Chair's Time

#### A. Roll Call

Roll call was taken and a quorum was established.

### Call for Public Comment

Chair Kramer called for public comment, inquiring as to whether there were person(s) who wished to comment on any agenda item. The following comments were provided to the Committee:

1. Benjamin Kohn

Benjamin Kohn expressed support for the alternative pathways to licensure.

2. Reverend Frank

Reverend Frank expressed concern on missing Board of Trustees meeting recordings on the State Bar's website.

3. Ray Hayden

Ray Hayden provided public comment on their proposal for an alternative pathway to licensure program.

## **II. Report from Director**

### **A. Action and Discussion on Recommendations related to the Alternative Pathway Working Group's Proposal to Develop a Portfolio Bar Examination**

**RESOLVED**, that Board of Trustees be informed of the Committee of Bar Examiners' support for further exploring the Portfolio Bar Exam proposal drafted by the Alternative Pathway Working Group; and

**FURTHER RESOLVED**, that the Committee of Bar Examiners recommends that the Board of Trustees forward the Portfolio Bar Exam proposal to the Supreme Court with a recommendation that the Supreme Court authorize further exploration of a Portfolio Bar Exam; and

**FURTHER RESOLVED**, that the Committee of Bar Examiners' recommends that the Board of Trustees include as part of that recommendation that the Committee of Bar Examiners participate meaningfully in the exploration of the Portfolio Bar Exam.

*Moved by Kareem Gongora, seconded by Ashley Silva-Guzman*

*Ayes – (13) James A. Bolton, Ph.D., Kareem Gongora, Larry Kaplan, Bethany Peak,  
Ashley Silva-Guzman, Paul A. Kramer*

*Noes – (3) Michael Cao, M.D, Alex H. Chan, Esther Lin*

*Abstain – (0)*

*Recuse- (0)*

*Absent – (5) Robert S. Brody, James Efting, Dolores Heisinger, Alexander C. Lawrence, Jr., Vincent Reyes, David A. Torres*

*Motion carries.*

**CLOSED SESSION**

**NONE**

**ADJOURN**